Highest and Best Use Evaluation Matrix by Segment

11/30/2015 Stone Consulting

TRAVELING WEST FROM KINGSTON TO HIGHMOUNT

	TRAVELING W	VEST FROM KINGSTON TO HI	IGHMOUNT					Initial Stone
MP	Location	Description	Status	Significant issues	Rail only use notes	Trail only use notes	RWT notes	Recommendation
START 2.9 to	MP 2.9 to Cornell St.	CSX connection and missing track switch to Ulster County railroad	disconnected out of service inside fences at DEP/Post ofc	DEP and Post Office parking lot, switch removed. Outside CSX yard limits Railmark mentioned transload	CMRR desires interchange for charter & Equipment movements via CSX in plan May be valid pending	No current trail proposal identifies section as a valid trail segment	Not proposed	High cost of CSXT switch likely in PTC territory Rail only if market
3.1		Switch in PTC territory	does not exist	in EOI letter High cost at CSXT terms	more information Only valid if market found		N/A	proven for transload
	.2 miles	on CSXT main line outside Kingston yard		Not a biddable project as not on county property	for transload services that can justify segment to MP 6	Not proposed	Not proposed	
3.1 to 3.58	Cornell St. to Albany Ave (beyond)	Narrow ROW with two tight overpasses Third overpass OK Freight service needs as separate issue based on EOI validity	in service passenger	CMRR's only maintenance area for Kingston operations unless relocated elsewhere Necessary for access to MP 2.9 to? MP 5.9?	ROW currently used but gated for adjacent property owners Likely rebuild for higher weight loads (tie cond.) and realign for trail clearance	Desired for city area greenway (high priority area to County) Neighborhood greenway	Two overpasses would use flangeway crossovers rather than climb to St. level Track shift for clearance Would need special operating rules and low speed in district for safety	Trail if no freight transload identified relocate RR maint. Area Trail likely RWT attempt if transload ca can show impacts and market for services Underpass mitigation.
	.46 1111165						TOT Safety	Olider pass fill tigation.
3.58 to 4.4	Albany Ave to Washington	Kingston Plaza area Interface with City of Kingston	in service passenger	Core area for Kingston boarding and special events Destination for downtown trail connection for local	Kingston area maint. Shop needed in this area if Cornell St. vacated Needs new boarding area	Relatively easy area for construction despite some ROW encroachments Needs restrooms and trailhead	Should be possible despite some encroachments Joint use structure for	RWT appears feasible across flats O&W trail connection
				neighborhoods.	with restrooms and retail Bridge rating for freight use?	at Kingston Plaza	both functions highly needed and would qualify multi-modal	allows connectivity west to O&W
4.4 to 5.9	Washington to Hurley Mt. Rd	Plaza to Hurley Mt. Road	in service passenger	Operating track for all special events Connectivity issues with other trails particularly 209-Hurley Mt.	RWT issues designed but costs unknown. Needed for operating room for any Kingston events	Work-arounds for connectivity are expensive including new bridge over Esopus Creek	Appears to be a workable compromise to Hurley Mt. road but with new bridge	RWT appears feasible Reinvestigate bridge O&W trail connection allows connectivity for a
		Freight service to 5.9 is only industrial parcel open			End of possible freight service zone - likely			high price tag w/bridge

Highest and Best Use Evaluation Matrix by Segment

11/30/2015 Stone Consulting

TRAVELING WEST FROM KINGSTON TO HIGHMOUNT

	TRAVELING WE	ST FROM KINGSTON TO H	IGHMOUNT					Initial Stone
MP	Location	Description	Status	Significant issues	Rail only use notes	Trail only use notes	RWT notes	Recommendation
					Hurley crossing protection.	Hurley crossing protection.		*** critical area ****
5.9	Hurley Mt. Road	Hurley Mt. Road;	in service	Narrow Bluestone cut;	Allows continued operations	Connectivity to Ashokan.	Most difficult area to	RWT but very difficult
to	to	Includes current Polar	passenger	tight ROW, encroachments,	to a "North Pole" area for	Will require excavation for	resolve on lower end of	to accomplish; recr.
6.74	Siding Area	Express "North Pole"	to aprox 6.5	difficult trail placement for	Kingston special events	clearing 12' trail section	corridor	trail cross section only for
		location for 2014 and 2015		.75 miles, recr. width only		even if no rail presence		.75 miles. NYDOT issues
6.74								
to	Siding Area	Former passing siding	out of	relatively easy	Extends operations for	Connectivity to Ashokan	Easiest RWT section on	
7.28	with double	double-track width	service	to accomplish	events with minimal trail	Easy construction area	entire county profile without	RWT if can be reached
	track space		passable	for additional run distance	interferance for full width	with full trail width even w/rail	conflicts	through 6.74
	·			of half a mile for rail events	trail section	·		Full width trail possible
					Extends run to 3.7 miles			
7.28		Single track on hillside	out of	Narrow ROW above Rt. 28	General drainage rehab.	Some minor fill widening necessary	Recreational trail only with	
to	Hill to Rt.	in original construction zone	service	with various shale cuts, 2	destination issue remains	for 12' trail profile. Area is on 2%	some shale fill excavation and	RWT but subject to
8.33	28A crossing	from 1868.	passable	significant fills	destination issue remains	grade and subject to highway noise.	fill widening toward hillside	any access to hill destination
0.55	20/4 (10331116	110111 1000.	passable	Significant mis		Provides connectivity to Ashokan	Possible environmental issues	site availability for rail.
						.,	on upper forested hillside	Delay for trail ROW cleanup
8.33	28A to	Original line to 8.79, then	out of	Zone of high fill through	Clean out cuts but generally	Large fill will require possible	Virtually infeasible based	RWT not feasible on fill.
to	Basin Road	relocation to 10	service	wetlands, commercial zone	just tie work for rail only	lowering to achieve 12'+railings	on high fill issues across	Rail depends on potential
10	DEP boundary		passable	adjacent, then deep but	Crossing at 28A hazard	both sides. Commercial	wetland with steep side	site availability for rail.
				wide Bluestone cut		activity beside trail.	slopes.	Delay for trail ROW cleanup
						Provides connectivity to Ashokan Crossing at 28A hazard	Trail relocation on 28A unlikely just as narrow a corridor	Research Basin Rd all
						Crossing at ZoA nazaru	just as narrow a corridor	Neseurch Busin Nu un
10	Boundary to	Boundary line to west		Within DEP agreement	No significant impediments.	Grade decreases. Trailhead area	Very feasible based on	
to	Glenford Dike	end of Glenford Dike	out of	area signed 2015. Rail OR	Provides special events area	proposed. 600' back from Rt. 28.	original RWT beside stone wall	Trail if DEP does not allow
11		(CMRR business plan	service	trail usage, not both	at West Hurley and viewscape	Likely prime trailhead location on	and wide cut widths	rail access to W. Hurley or
		destination zone)	passable	Contested area of interest	at Glenford Dike.	east end	DEP did not sign agreement	Glenford Dike as destination
				creating conflicting use.	Next reservoir view is at Boiceville end 8 miles away	Reservoir view excellent from dike areas for trail users	for RWT provision No incentive for DEP	
					at Boiceville end o filles away	Full width feasible and designed	No incentive for DEP	
						Destination trail features present		
11	Glenford Dike	Glenford Dike to Shokan	out of	Within DEP agreement	Generally 'green tunnel'	Flat and wooded alternative to	Not proposed by CMRR as	
to	to Shokan	generally parallel to Rt. 28	service	area signed 2015. Rail OR	beside Rt. 28 with	paved Rt. 28 shoulders	active rail usage in	Destination trail usage
16.4	MOW shed		passable	trail usage, not both	no remarkable views	Full width trail designed	business plan.	
					for rail use	Destination trail features present	No alternative trail alignment	
							proposed. Single-track ROW	
							on minor cuts and fills	1

Highest and Best Use Evaluation Matrix by Segment

11/30/2015 Stone Consulting

TRAVELING WEST FROM KINGSTON TO HIGHMOUNT

Initia	l Stone

MP	Location	Description	Status	Significant issues	Rail only use notes	Trail only use notes	RWT notes	Recommendation
16.4 to 18.?	Shokan to Butternut Cove	Generally woodland alignment well away from Rt. 28 and Reservoir	out of service passable	Within DEP agreement area signed 2015. Rail OR trail usage, not both	Generally 'green tunnel' through forest with no remarkable views	Flat and wooded alternative to paved Rt. 28 shoulders Full width trail designed Destination trail features present Removed from highway noise	Not proposed by CMRR as active rail usage in business plan. proposed. Single-track ROW on minor cuts and fills	Destination trail usage
18.? to 21.6	Butternut Cove to Boiceville Bridge (Rt. 28A crossing)	Reservoir views and possibly most scenic specific area for any usage of corridor	out of service (washout and bridge down)	Within DEP agreement area signed 2015. Rail OR trail usage, not both	Best scenery on a restorable segment, but far from Kingston	Best trail experience on entire corridor area, likely 'most used' area of proposed trail sections	Not proposed by CMRR as active rail usage in business plan. Portions of ROW on narrow causeway	Destination trail usage
21.6 to 23.3	Rt. 28A to Coldbrook Washout	Generally creekside; Coldbrook Sta. at 22.1	out of service (washout and bridge down)	inaccessible to any use due to washout. Funding received but question on sufficiency	Coldbrook sta. historic/restored but privately owned No passing siding at 28A or at Coldbrook	Good creekside and waterway access where Rt. 28 cannot reach Proposed by county as 'rail only'	Does not appear to be proposed for RWT due to County rail designation	Rail usage w/proper site incl. Stand-alone only with full feature event site/term. and interface with trail
23.3 to 25.7	Washout to Rt. 28 crossing Mt. Trempor	Generally creekside and isolated	In service passenger	Current CMRR operations zone to washout	Current most scenic area away from Rt. 28 highway corridor in operation	Good creekside and waterway access where Rt. 28 cannot reach Proposed by county as 'rail only'	Does not appear to be proposed for RWT due to County rail designation	Rail usage
25.7 to 27.8	Rt. 28 to Mt. Trempor and Phonecia	Generally roadside with Route 28 visible	In service passenger	Current CMRR operations to Mt. Trempor	Washout recently rebuilt to allow operations to Phonecia Museum owns parcels adjacent	Generally in same corridor as highway but on creekside. Proposed by county as 'rail only'	Does not appear to be proposed for RWT due to County rail designation	Rail usage
27.8 to 28.8	Phonecia - Bridge C34 washout	Entire roadbed missing to Woodland Valley Road short section visible	Out of service roadbed partially missing	Grade wiped out for significant portions of parallel distance generally visible from 28	Grade missing Bridge out at 28.8 ROW heavily overgrown	Bridge out at 28.8 Out of Rt. 28 corridor beyond ROW heavily overgrown	Not proposed	Future trail usage
28.8 to 33.?	C34 bridge to Rt. 28 crossing Shandaken	South creek alignment with limited washouts at creekside locations Crossing removed on 28	Out of service roadbed partially missing	Grade wiped out in isolated locations Difficult to field-check	Alloben bridge remains Rail intact but heavily overgrown	Good location south of Rt. 28 corridor with alternate woodland and creekside locations. Bridge intact at Alloban	Not proposed	Future trail usage

Highest and Best Use Evaluation Matrix by Segment

11/30/2015 Stone Consulting

TRAVELING WEST FROM KINGSTON TO HIGHMOUNT

Initial Stone

MP	Location	Description	Status	Significant issues	Rail only use notes	Trail only use notes	RWT notes	Recommendation
		20001190011			The state of the s	The strip use notes		
33.? to 36.77	Rt. 28 Shandaken to Big Indian bridge	South creek alignment with limited washouts at creekside locations Crossing removed on 28	Out of service roadbed partially missing	Grade wiped out in isolated locations Difficult to field-check	Big Indian bridge, piers and abutments removed after Irene in 2011	Likely detour via highway around missing Big Indian bridge beyond Lasher Rd. bridge	Not proposed	Future trail usage
36.77 to 36.89	Big Indian bridge to Lasher Rd. br	Begin 3.4% grade Bridge removed at Lasher Rd. due to low clearance	Bridges removed out of serv.	Grade heavily overgrown	Lasher Rd. bridge removed for emergency vehicle clearance.	Trail will likely have to detour with two missing bridges	Not proposed	Unlikely for rail or trail
36.89 to 40	Lasher Rd. Br to Pine Hill	3.4% grade to former station site at Pine Hill	very narrow underpass on Station Rd E. of site	Overgrown but bridges intact	Accessible from west end (DURR) with track rehab only	Potential for winter use with rails remaining in place Ski resort.	Not proposed but could be seasonal	Trail potential but subject to connectivity. High potential for ski-related trail or seasonal use
40 to 41.6	Pine Hill to County Line Highmount	3.4% grade around 2 sharp curves uphill to former Grand Hotel station	Out of service partially cleared at Grand Hotel DURR has operated from west in 2013	Spectacular but difficult railroad alignment down mountainside 2 horseshoe curves	Accessible from west end (DURR) with track rehab only DURR has expressed specific interest in this portion	Potential for winter use with rails remaining in place Ski resort in vicinity.	Not proposed but could be seasonal wintertime and meet Camoin goals	DURR Tourist rail use if agreement reached with County w/lease payment as economics favor Delaware County
	1.6 miles							